

BEFORE THE HUMAN RIGHTS COMMISSION
OF THE STATE OF MONTANA

JEFF RYAN,
Charging Party

-v-

DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
QUALITY & PAUL SKUBINNA,
Respondent

HRB CASE NO. 0151017136 &
0151017137

FINAL AGENCY DECISION

Charging Party, Jeff Ryan (Ryan), filed a complaint with the Department of Labor and Industry (Department) alleging discrimination in employment on the basis of age. Following an informal investigation, the Department determined that a preponderance of the evidence did not support Ryan's allegations that Respondent, Department of Environmental Quality and Paul Skubinna, discriminated against Ryan. The Department issued a Notice of Dismissal. Ryan filed an objection with the Montana Human Rights Commission (Commission). The Commission considered the matter on September 18, 2015. Jeff Ryan appeared and argued on his behalf of himself. Edward Hayes appeared and argued on behalf of Department of Environmental Quality and Paul Skubinna.

The Commission reviews a decision of the Department to dismiss a complaint using an abuse of discretion standard. *Section 49-2-511(2), MCA*. After careful consideration, the Commission concludes the determination of the Department to dismiss the complaint in this case is not an abuse of discretion.

If a charging party chooses to commence a civil action in district court, the charging party has 90 days after the date this order is issued to file a complaint in district court, in the district where the alleged violation occurred, and seek appropriate relief. *Section 49-2-511(3)(a), MCA*. If a charging party fails to commence a civil action within 90 days, the claims are time barred. *Id.*

Alternatively, a party may ask a district court to review the decision of the Commission to affirm the dismissal of a complaint. *Sections 2-4-702 and 49-2-511(3)(b), MCA.* This review must be requested within 30 days of the date of this order. A party must promptly serve copies of a petition for judicial review upon the Human Rights Commission and all parties of record. *Section 2-4-702(2), MCA.*

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED, that Jeff Ryan's objection is **overruled**. The Commission affirms the determination of the Human Rights Bureau to dismiss the complaint against Department of Environmental Quality and Paul Skubinna.

DATED this 22nd day of September, 2015.



Dennis M. Taylor, Chair
Human Rights Commission

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned secretary for the Human Rights Commission certifies that a true and correct copy of the foregoing ORDER was mailed to the following by U.S. Mail, postage prepaid, on this 22nd day of September, 2015.

JEFF RYAN
6425 JASPER ROAD
HELENA, MT 59602

EDWARD HAYES
JOHN F. NORTH
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY
P.O. BOX 200901
HELENA, MT 59620-0901

Annah Howard

Annah Howard, Legal Secretary
Montana Human Rights Bureau